REVIEW

of a dissertation on the topic: "The influence of the simulation workshop in education on the effective activity of the teacher" for awarding the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" of Yasmin Balum in the field of higher education Pedagogical sciences; Professional field 1.2. Pedagogy; Scientific specialty: Theory of education and didactics

Scientific adviser: Assoc. Prof. Veska Guviyska Ph.D.

Reviewer: Prof. Dobrinka Todorina D.Sc.

In the conditions of the modern requirements for permanent search of the conditions, the forms, the methods and the means for increase of the quality of the education, in the center of the decision of this important problem is the teacher. From the standpoint of his profession, he is responsible for increasing the effectiveness of both the activities of his students and his own activities and achievements, which are correlated. The influence of the simulation workshop in education in the direction of ensuring higher quality and efficiency is definitely a pedagogical innovation that deserves attention. Simulation-based educational technologies undoubtedly contribute to the improvement of the educational environment and increased effectiveness of the pedagogical process. In this sense, the dissertation developed by PhD student Yasmin Balum is a timely phenomenon.

The paper submitted for review contains 175 pages of printed text and is structured in an introduction, three chapters, a conclusion, literature and 12 pages of appendices (3 in number). The literature used is from 231 sources in English, Hebrew and Internet positions. In the main text the author includes 12 tables and 6 figures.

A. Analysis of the scientific achievements of the doctoral student:

I. On the selection and formulation of the topic and parameters of research in the dissertation:

PhD student Yasmin Balum is clearly aware of the importance and relevance of the chosen research problem. The introduction outlines the important motives for focusing on the chosen topic, which is dissertable, given its place in the educational space and the incompleteness in its previous research.

- 1. The formulation of the topic clearly and specifically orients to the specifics of the dissertation.
- 2. It is also important that the successful experience of the Israeli education system is presented, given the development of simulation programs carried out in cooperation between the Ministry of Education and Culture of Israel and the Moffett Institute.
- 3. The aspect included in the research program for evaluation of the activity by the participants in the constructed team of teachers, pupils, students, principals, parents, as well as the self-evaluation of the teachers towards the effectiveness of the implemented simulation program, activities and respective achievements deserves attention.

II. On the existence, argumentation and approbation of scientific ideas, concepts, paradigms:

1. In the literature review in the first chapter it becomes clear that the doctoral student knows a number of author's opinions on the research topic. Basic theoretical approaches in the field of psychology, pedagogy, sociology, pedeutology are covered. A number of research searches on the chosen research problem are illustrated. Current educational concepts are analyzed. Pedagogical and methodological innovations are included in

- order to improve the quality of education and teacher training for the new times in which we live.
- 2. It is rightly emphasized that the competences of the teacher are extremely important for the effectiveness of the actions of their students. Emphasis is placed on the conditions for realization of the educational function of the teacher, on the planning and management of the students' activity, on the role of the shown initiative, in order to increase the efficiency of the education.
- 3. Attention is paid to teacher training, including through the inclusion of practical training. A special place is given to a study, which sets out several main points: providing instructions; assessment and feedback to students; providing appropriate conditions in the learning environment, including classroom management; building personal qualities of the teacher: care for the emergence of positive relationships, justice, enthusiasm and encouragement to take responsibility. It is determined that the presence of these qualities in teachers contribute to their good performance in work and ensuring student achievement.
- 4. In the framework of the presentation by the doctoral student of the status of the teaching profession, some of the important professional and personal qualities of the teacher are justifiably presented. The great importance of the theoretical knowledge of the teacher is emphasized, but also the need for them to be related to practical skills. Attention is drawn to the managerial role of the teacher and that he should be an expert in education and a professional with extensive knowledge and ability to use his knowledge to improve student learning.
- 5. Emphasis is placed on the professional knowledge of the teacher about his ability to identify learning problems by knowing their symptoms, the ability to implement specific activities to improve students' learning ability.
- 6. Attention is also paid to the established determinants such as: the need to adapt the learning content according to the abilities of the students, the specifics of the learning environment at school, the set deadlines for education.
- 7. The difficulty of the teaching profession is presented, as well as the challenges that must be taken into account for example, the difficult beginning in the career development of teachers, the evaluation of teachers' work, the moments of transformation of theoretical knowledge into practical knowledge and experience.
- 8. Emphasizes the need to evaluate the tools used in education, with an emphasis on simulations, which aim to simulate real-world scenarios and help in the acquisition of knowledge. It is reasonably concluded that the experience in teaching and simulation training is of great importance for improving the teaching of teachers and hence for improving the learning outcomes of students.
- 9. The doctoral student refers to the important approaches in education: behavioral, constructive-cognitive and radical constructivism and on this basis clarifies the learning of students as a purposeful and step-by-step process.
- 10. Teachers' views on teacher teaching and student learning, as well as the relationship between them, are presented.
- 11. Due attention is paid to existing teacher training programs with an emphasis on the relationship between theoretical and practical training. The great importance of the practical training and the difficulties that accompany it is highlighted. It is recommended to intensify the group discussion after the end of the practical training period.
- 12. It is noteworthy that the peculiarity presented in the system of teacher training in Israel is that before the actual exercise of the teaching profession a one-year internship period

- is introduced, with a view to improving the practical experience of future teachers. This is a positive phenomenon in the Israeli education system.
- 13. Of interest is the finding from a study in Israel and some Western countries that there is a big difference between the knowledge that teachers receive in teaching and the knowledge they need at work. This is again a request for more attention to the practical training of teachers.
- 14. Achieving professional success is associated with the use of critical self-reflection and reflexive activity in a group, as well as with the application of simulation methods, relying on the conduct of repeated experiments based on the presence of risk situations.
- 15. It is reasonable to raise the issue of promoting ethical behavior of teachers, as they are always a model of behavior among students, families and society. In this regard, research is being conducted to establish a code of ethics in which to determine the desired behavior. Seminars are held in the direction of improving the moral behavior of teachers, based on constructed models and scenarios for decision-making. The types of ethical dilemmas and the need to choose the best ones in the name of caring for students are also considered.
- 16. The doctoral student also pays attention to the construction of ethical rules and decision-making as appropriate. The choice of ethical behavior is different due to differences in culture, race, gender and language.
- 17. Attempts are also made to bridge the educational gap between the theoretical and practical part of teacher training programs, which face a great and constant challenge to train teachers who excel in their profession in providing high quality education.
- 18. It is appropriate to carry out research to establish a correspondence for success between the provision of educational content and the choice of an appropriate method of teaching this content, which will improve the effectiveness of the teacher in the classroom and increase the likelihood of him remaining in the teaching profession.
- 19. Central to the theoretical part of the dissertation is the study of teacher self-efficacy. In the considered psychological context the connection with the self-concept and self-esteem is meant. The PhD student focuses on teachers 'perceptions of their own competencies and educational achievements in relation to classroom behavior and student outcomes, as well as on students' beliefs about self-efficacy, motivation and achievement.
- 20. The PhD student is aware that the sources of beliefs about teachers 'self-efficacy are not sufficiently known, but social cognitive theory provides some general guidance on possible sources of teachers' perceptions of effectiveness. It is in this context that four sources are offered: experiences of mastery, experiences of intention, verbal persuasion, and physiological arousal. Assessing the beliefs of teachers about self-efficacy, the doctoral student takes the position that the most powerful of them are the masterful experiences that come to teachers from their actual teaching achievements with students. Accordingly, beliefs about effectiveness decrease if the teacher considers that his performance is unsuccessful and this leads to the failure of future performances.
- 21. It is rightly emphasized that self-efficacy is a motivational construction that depends on the self-perception of competence and not on the actual level of competence it can be higher or lower than the external assessment of the teacher's skill.
- 22. It is clearly defined that the belief in the capabilities of the individual is a strong motivation, adequate to the desire to work and make an effort to pursue certain goals. According to the theory of self-efficacy, it is emphasized that teachers' self-beliefs are related to their actions and the results they have achieved.
- 23. Due attention is also paid to collective efficiency, which is defined as the belief in the group's ability to achieve desired goals. Academic failure can lead to a reduction in

- collective efficiency among teachers and this reduces effort and perseverance and leads to lower student effectiveness and hence reduced teacher self-efficacy. It is emphasized that the availability of certain school practices has contributed to increasing efficiency among newly appointed teachers, and the greater the opportunity to collaborate with other adults, the more observations are made about the resulting sense of effectiveness.
- 24. Due attention is also paid to the school climate, as school conditions affect the self-efficacy of teachers. Interviews with teachers show that the elements of the climate and the structure of the school can hinder the development of strong beliefs about self-efficacy.
- 25. The dissertation also presents the relationship between the management of the school principal and the self-efficacy of teachers. It is important to inspire common sense, protect against destructive forces, set a model for appropriate behavior and provide rewards for achieving good results. Then teachers feel inclined to assess their own competence.
- 26. A very important place is given to the role of the simulation seminar, which is in full adequacy with the topic of the dissertation. Simulation is seen as an effective educational tool for effective teacher activity. Simulation training relies on building skills for inclusion, listening and empathy.
- 27. The history of simulation training is presented, examples of its use in the training of medical professionals are given, but its role in the training of teachers and school leaders is outlined.
- 28. It is emphasized that the simulation method in teaching is a teaching method that allows real experience within original scenarios suitable for students, and that this educational method exists in many different fields such as medicine, administration, financial sciences, banking and insurance. The doctoral student explains that the method of simulation is adapted to the educational environment in which the students are present. Special rooms are used in which the technology for recording and photography is present, which makes it possible to study the group.
- 29. It is envisaged to capture the simulations in video and watch the shots taken immediately after the simulation. At the beginning of the seminar, a short explanation of the process is given, after which the script is presented to the participants and a volunteer is chosen to participate in the process, as well as other people who represent the other roles of the characters in the script. An analysis of the presented scenario is made and an assessment is given, after which the necessary proposals for improving or changing the approach for obtaining the final results are presented.
- 30. At the end of the simulation session, feedback sessions and a general summary of the seminar are held, so that everyone comes out with a significant personal vision. The PhD student is aware that the simulation method is becoming a modern trend in a number of areas in Israel and around the world. Today, there are more than 10 simulation centers in Israel. One of these centers is located at the David Yelin College of Education, where Ballum's experimental work is being conducted.
- 31. Some shortcomings arising from the understanding of this method, such as increased confidence and risk of error, have also been rightly noted. There is a danger that the simulation will become an end in itself and separate from professional practice, which is why preliminary preparation for its use must be carried out.
- 32. The importance of the simulation process is presented, emphasizing its role for accuracy, ease of use and connection between the objectives of teaching and the learning process; providing a "sense of real presence" so that consumers, in a sense, "put an end to mistrust", engage with the simulated environment as real, and feel a personal responsibility to improve their practice; allows the study of the roles of the

- teacher and the formation of the group and thus this method reaches generalizing conclusions; increases confidence in learners' ability to communicate with students; allows students to try new things. Improvements in learning are seen as part of the self-assessment process over time.
- 33. Ballum's finding that the simulation depends on the existence of an effective educational approach allowing scenarios to be presented in a way that allows learning to be transferred to real practices is correct.
- 34. The role of the collective investigation as one of the most important components of the simulation is also presented. Emphasis is placed on sharing feelings, reflection and reconstruction through the participants' responses. In this way, appropriate professional training is facilitated.
- 35. It is clarified that each simulated conference is recorded on a video to be used in the feedback process to retrieve the available information. Educational sessions are considered to be effective tools as they allow to increase interaction and improve the effectiveness of teachers. However, sessions that combine educational training and self-qualification enable teachers to make the necessary changes to increase teaching self-efficacy. Their ability to interact with students increases, especially compared to those with special educational needs.
- 36. The simulation is compared with the games and it is emphasized that what distinguishes the simulation from other games is that it does not explicitly involve competition, participants perform specific roles, experiment with procedures and see results, try new procedures. When simulation is compared to meditation, it provides an opportunity to learn through experience.
- 37. The PhD student emphasizes that the main advantage of using the simulation method is that the participating students are active in the process and not passive observers and this motivates them to express their own views on the process that stimulates thinking, information retrieval and repetition. process when needed. The use of this method supports the exercise of new educational roles, which develops self-efficacy over time. The use of this method supports the exercise of new educational roles, which develops self-efficacy over time.
- 38. The PhD student presents a categorization of the situational simulations on the basis of their positions, tasks, specializations and supporting techniques. They are also seen as aspects of the work environment and what is present in personal interactions, which makes them particularly applicable to teacher training and assessment. The simulation is described as a scenario, conflict or emergency, and the student must make certain decisions regarding the response to situations and develop strategies to correct the identified situations, as he should do in real life.
- 39. Attention is also paid to the regulation of teachers' emotions and the manifestation of professional responsibility, as they are a good example for students to follow.
- 40. A special place is given to team-based simulations. It is envisaged that a process of cooperative learning will take place through an investigation phase, in which participants will have several in-depth discussions on the issue under consideration in order to consider how to find possible solutions before reaching a final solution. At this stage, players receive feedback from their peers about their behavior and this is recorded in a video.
- 41. The simulation provides teachers with an environment in which to understand what to do in the event of critical ethical incidents and how to deal with these circumstances.
- 42. The PhD student comes to the appropriate conclusion that the main thing for the simulation method is the simulation to simulate the characteristics of the behavior of "participants in the system" for purposes such as: decision-making skills, instructions,

- training, learning and explanation, assessment, ability to deal with various possible situations and scenarios, achieving predictions of possible behavior and consequences and improving future users in the simulated system.
- 43. The computer simulations in education are also presented. The purpose of computer simulation in training is defined to allow users to apply ideas and theories learned during training courses and turn them into scenarios that simulate reality in the simulation environment. It is explained that the Online Simulation focuses on teaching students with special needs and in this method relies on virtual circuits to prepare the class while creating specific decisions for the teacher about the structure of the lesson, including classroom management and interaction with students. Educational materials are supported through Internet connections. The role of this method for the development of professional skills in teachers has been determined, which connects the theory with the educational practices in reality.
- 44. The doctoral student also pays attention to double-cycle learning in education, due to its established effectiveness. It is done not only through experimentation, but also through thinking about "variable management". It is becoming an effective tool and thus differs from single-cycle education by changing methods, working to improve efficiency in achieving specific educational goals. However, it is emphasized that "double-chain learning" is difficult and requires changing thinking habits, challenging and restructuring established assumptions in order to act later in new and unfamiliar ways. teachers in universities and this is enshrined in accreditation institutions (National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education, 2010; Council for Accreditation of Teacher Training, 2013.) Learning through this method allows access to places that do not exist in reality, the middle of on the other hand, it is risk-free and provides comprehensive educational opportunities for participants with a high degree of control, quality and rigor..

III. On the technological mechanism for conducting the theoretical-experimental research and the ability for analysis:

- 1. The theoretical-empirical research conducted by doctoral student Yasmin Balum and the use of appropriate research methods for its implementation shows the existence of competencies for planning and conducting a comprehensive dissertation research.
- 2. In the theoretical part of the research the doctoral student presents important theoretical statements, scientific ideas and concepts, without, however, clearly defining her own position. She is very well acquainted with the theoretical sources on the researched problem and the changes that have occurred in recent years.
- 3. There is a relatively complete coverage of the issue through the outlined dynamics of the researched topic, but without a sufficiently precise definition of the status of pediatrics (the science of the teacher and the teaching profession).
- 4. Objectivity of the research is guaranteed through the use of authoritative authors, mainly in the field of psychology and pedagogy.
- 5. Demonstrated ability to detect problems and make a logical connection between them.
- 6. The research methodology is described in detail in a separate chapter (second). Adequacy between theoretical and empirical research is ensured. In connection with the topic of the study and its specifics, the main questions are identified, to which, if appropriate, answers should be given through empirical research: 1. How effective is the method of the simulation workshop in education? 2. How does the simulation

- seminar affect teachers' self-efficacy? The doctoral student gives convincing answers to these questions.
- 7. The defined research methods are in accordance with the specifics of the research program. In this study, a mixed study method was used, which is a combination of quantitative and qualitative research. Representativeness of the sample was ensured through the participation of about 1567 subjects, including 814 Arab participants and 753 Jewish participants in the survey and 152 participants in the experiment. The tools for quantitative and qualitative research are presented separately.
- 8. A research questionnaire shall be included in the quantitative research toolkit. There is a demographic part developed for the purposes of the study obtaining basic data: age, nationality, marital status, education and field of education of the participants in the simulation seminars. Emphasis is placed on issues that describe the choice of field of education: professional identity of the teacher; simulation efficiency; conducting simulation seminars, which includes video recording of the participants in the seminar and the participation of professional actors. The quantitative analysis of the survey data was performed using the SPSS-12 program and statistically significant analyzes were performed: factor, correlation, regression, variation, bidirectional ANOVA analyzes, which are used to detect the difference between Arabs and Jews, as well as between teachers, and students. Separate analyzes were performed for all study variables.
- 9. The tool for qualitative research is the interview and more precisely the non-standardized interview, through which data are collected for the participants in the simulation seminars. It is used to explore participants' perceptions, along with examining the complexity of the role and understanding the relationships between the various aspects found in the simulation workshop. This approach is used to explore the importance of change and its impact on participants in simulation workshops, while recognizing the importance of the social and practical context. The impact of the simulation seminar on the self-efficacy of the participants is established, while outlining the difficulties encountered before and during the seminar. The doctoral student is aware that all this is done to understand the importance that each participant attaches to his place and role in this educational environment.
- 10. Objectivity and reality of the results are guaranteed the researcher himself emphasizes that there are certain limitations, uncertainties, challenges, omissions and difficulties in conducting the research.
- 11. It is important to keep in mind that one of the most important things that helped the researcher prepare for this study was that she was of Arabic descent and Arabic was her mother tongue. This allows her to deal with half of the interviewees as well as the other half of the interviewees who speak Hebrew. This has a positive effect on their willingness to participate in the preparation of this study and to delve into the study itself. In addition, these facts have a positive effect on the interaction that occurred between the researcher and the participants during the interviews. This experience is the first of its kind and we can talk about various aspects in simulation seminars, global perspectives of teachers, participants and leaders of change.
- 12. A process of checking the validity and reliability of the study has been carried out, which is a mandatory component when conducting an experimental study. An important fact about the accuracy of the research is that the process of evaluation of the research is done by documenting all materials: personal lists, research questionnaires,

- records, transcripts of interviews, letters and various materials. The statistical results are linked and recorded in the form of brochures and CD backups.
- 13. In the third chapter the statistical data are presented in detail and a qualitative analysis of the obtained results is made. The main purpose of this study is to describe how the participants in the simulation workshop, who provide feedback, assess its potential contribution to the development of teaching and communication skills. The results of the questionnaires and interviews include descriptive information about the individual and organizational characteristics, as well as the perceptions of the participants in the seminar, the reactions to the seminar and the analysis of the differences in perception. Open questions include session suggestions, video integration, and potential areas for including videos in educational seminars.
- 14. Descriptive analysis of quantitative data shows the effectiveness of the simulation. A great effect was found in all the studied elements: feedback received from the leader and the group, video recording, participation of professional actors, seminar management, dialogue and discussion, emotional and reflective feelings, interpersonal communication, teaching communication skills, script and work. of the participant, efficiency and active participation.
- 15. The obtained results are presented tabularly and graphically, and in full adequacy the qualitative analysis is carried out in the direction of: efficiency of the simulation; video efficiency; management of the simulation workshop with the participation of professional actors; evaluation of the active participation in the seminar; level of emotional, reflective and interpersonal communication; impact of the scenario on the training and perceptions of the participants; the relationship between the script and the professional world; the impact of the scenario on the participant's work; differences between participants from the Arab and Jewish populations.
- 16. In the third chapter an analysis is made of the qualitative data about the nature of the effect of the simulation on the construction of the educational perceptions of the teachers, as well as about the way they teach in the classroom: perceptions for learning and teaching; development of behavior in the classroom; perceptions of the technology used, videos and scripts; self-efficacy of teachers.
- 17. The qualitative analysis of the results is made precisely, giving specific examples for illustration, finding the causal links, making valuable summaries.
- 18. The presented discussion on the obtained results complements the qualitative analysis and proves once again the positive influence of the simulation workshop in education on the effective activity of the teacher.
- 19. In the conclusion the doctoral student makes summaries in the direction of the made theoretical-experimental research and gives some recommendations. However, it is incorrect in this concluding part to present again theoretical statements of some authors. It is positive to outline a perspective in research on the topic. It becomes clear that the doctoral student correctly assesses her own achievements and what else can be done within the research issues. It also raises some questions that can be answered in the future in order to improve the quality of education.

IV. By style and language of development:

1. Unfortunately, due to the language barrier for foreign doctoral students, the scientific style of writing needs to be improved. The language of local development is not clear, precise and grammatically correct. There are also technical errors.

- 2. A sufficient number of literature sources have been used: in English, Hebrew and Internet positions.
- 3. Correct citation is present, but the doctoral student's own position is not well presented. There is a need for a critical sense.
- 4. In the experimental part of the development there is a good illustration of the results through tabular and graphical presentation.

V. Contributions to the dissertation:

The doctoral student makes several contributions that correspond to the theoretical and experimental work carried out, but could be formulated more precisely.

Their existence is underpinned, in my opinion, by important grounds that are evident in the dissertation: ensuring the presupposition and compliance of the theoretical and experimental research with important scientific postulates such as: establishing the methodological position for the close relationship between theory and practice (in this case theoretical and practical teacher training); outlining the important didactic requirement for adequacy between the educational content and the way of teaching this content; seeking and establishing compliance for success through the development and implementation of pedagogical innovation (in this case simulation training).

In my opinion, the contributions have a theoretical and practical application.

- 1. Enrichment of the history, theory and practice of simulation training, its essence and role as an effective tool for improving the quality of education and preparation of teachers for the teaching profession, revealing the difficulties, shortcomings in its use and the risk of mistakes in its application.
- 2. Development of a variant of a simulation workshop model with instructions for work, feedback, scenarios, use of computer simulations, participation of actors, videos on the preparation of teachers to develop their sense of self-efficacy in relation to the competencies they have to achieve of effective school activity.
- 3. Enrichment of the theory of self-efficacy of the teacher in psychological aspect as a motivational construction, which depends on the self-perception and self-assessment of the teacher for the quality and effectiveness of his own work, including in terms of collective efficiency, appropriate school climate and school principal's guidance.
- 4. Discovering and proving through experimental research and testing in practice the importance of simulations for improving the quality of education through better knowledge transfer, beneficial interaction between teacher and students, increasing their activity, especially for students with special educational needs, stimulating their thinking, building decision-making skills, expressing one's own position, accepting new educational roles, regulating the emotions of teachers and students, developing teachers' professional skills.
- 5. Encouraging the ethical behavior of teachers by constructing ethical rules and proposing a code of ethics, with an emphasis on the choice of ethical behavior, dealing with conflict situations, depending on the determinants race, gender, language, culture.
- 6. Inclusion of the ideas for a double cycle in education in the programs for teacher training in universities, as this is set in the relevant institutions to accredit teacher

- education (National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education; Council for Accreditation of Teacher Training).
- 7. Giving a proposal, if appropriate, for the introduction of an internship period of 1 year, with a view to improving the much-needed practical training of teachers.

The abstract is in accordance with the text in the dissertation. Some logical and technical errors have been made. It objectively formulates the contributions to the dissertation, according to the author, as well as the publications on the topic of the dissertation. The mentioned 4 independent publications of the author on the topic are sufficient in number for research of this kind. Additional copies of the author's publications are presented, albeit in abbreviated form.

B. Recommendations and notes to the doctoral student:

- 1. The chapters in the dissertation are very general literature review, methodology, qualitative analysis of the results. They need to be titled in terms of content to make it clear what the specifics of the study are.
- 2. The statement of the study is not clearly presented. The abstract is very general. An accurate formulation of the object, subject, purpose, tasks, hypothesis of the research, and if possible the stages of the research is needed.
- 3. It is not good in the qualitative analysis and in the conclusion of the work to cite author's productions. They should be used in the theoretical part of the work. It is expedient for the doctoral student to express his own opinion, to summarize and draw conclusions.
- 4. It is correct to give the used internet positions in the literature at the end of the description of the literary sources.
- 5. If there is an opportunity, in her future research activity, the doctoral student to study the Bulgarian experience in pedagogy regarding the status of the teaching profession, teacher training, teacher functions, professional and personal qualities of the teacher in the Bulgarian scientific school.

Question to the doctoral student:

Does Yasmin Balum plan to develop a version of her own author's program for teacher training, overcoming the weaknesses allowed at the moment? What components will it include?

In conclusion:

The presented dissertation work, developed by the Israeli doctoral student (of Arab origin) Yasmin Balum, meets the basic requirements for the development of the educational and scientific degree "Doctor". There are some inconsistencies and mistakes, but I am aware of the difficulties she has faced as a foreign doctoral student and I believe that they can be corrected in a timely manner.

The doctoral student demonstrates competencies for detecting a dissertable problem and its development through rich theoretical and empirical research, adequate tools, objective quantitative and qualitative analysis of the results.

Based on the outlined merits and contributions of the work, I give a positive assessment of the work of Yasmin Balum and propose that have to be awarded the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in the field of higher education Pedagogical Sciences; Professional field 1.2. Pedagogy; The scientific specialty "Theory of education and didactics".

02.06.2021 Γ. Reviewer: Prof. Dobrinka Todorina D.Sc.

Blagoevgrad Signature: